Electronically Filed 2/17/2022 5:34 PM Seventh Judicial District, Lemhi County Brenda Armstrong, Clerk of the Court By: Jana Eagle, Deputy Clerk

IN THE DISTRICT COURT OF THE SEVENTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT OF THE

STATE OF IDAHO, IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF LEMHI

JAMES WHITTAKER, an individual, and WHITTAKER TWO DOT RANCH LLC, an Idaho limited liability company,	Case No. CV30-21-0304
Petitioners,	
VS.	
THE IDAHO DEPARTMENT OF WATER RESOURCES, an administrative agency of the State of Idaho,	
Respondent.	
IN THE MATTER OF APPLICATION FOR TRANSFER NO. 84441 IN THE NAME OF BRUCE AND GLENDA MCCONNELL	

SETTLED AGENCY RECORD ON APPEAL

Judicial Review from the Idaho Department of Water Resources Honorable Eric J. Wildman, District Judge, Presiding

GARRICK BAXTER, ISB No. 6301

MARK CECCHINI-BEAVER, ISB No. 9297 Deputy Attorneys General P.O. Box 83720 Boise, Idaho 83720-0098 garrick.baxter@idwr.idaho.gov mark.cecchini-beaver@idwr.idaho.gov

Attorneys for Respondent

Robert L. Harris, ISB No. 7018 Luke H. Marchant, ISB No. 7944 **HOLDEN, KIDWELL, HAHN** &CRAPO, P.L.L.C. P.O. Box 50130 Idaho Falls, ID 83405 rharris@holdenlegal.com efiling@holdenlegal.com

Attorneys for Petitioners James Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC Chris M Bromley, ISB No. 6530 Candice McHugh, ISB No. 5908 **McHUGH BROMLEY, PLLC** 380 S. 4th St., Ste. 103 Boise, ID 83702 <u>cbromley@mchughbromley.com</u> <u>cmchugh@mchughbromley.com</u>

Attorneys for Bruce and Glenda McConnell

TABLE OF CONTENTS

SETTLED AGENCY RECORD Prepared by the Idaho Department of Water Resources

Administrative Proceeding In re Application for Transfer No. 84441 in the Name of Bruce and Glenda McConnell

Table of Contents 3–8
Index
Application for Transfer of Water Right Nos. 74-361, 74-362, 74-363, 74-364, 74-365, 74-367, and 74-368 with Cover Letter—Transfer No. 84367—Bruce and Glenda McConnell, September 9, 2020
Declaration of Bruce McConnell—Transfer No. 84367—Bruce and Glenda McConnell, September 9, 2020
Proof Reports for Water Right Nos. 74-361, 74-362, 74-363, 74-364, 74-365, 74-367, and 74-368—Transfer No. 84367, September 10, 2020
Application for Transfer of Water Right Nos. 74-361, 74-362, 74-363, 74-364, 74-365, 74-367, and 74-368 with Cover Letter—Transfer No. 84441—Bruce and Glenda McConnell, October 5, 2020
Approved Transfer of Water Right Nos. 74-361, 74-362, 74-363, 74-364, 74-365, 74-367, and 74-368—Transfer No. 84367 Preliminary Order, October 8, 2020
Transfer Approval Notice for Water Right Nos. 74-361, 74-362, 74-363, 74-364, 74-365, 74-367, and 74-368, Letter—Transfer No. 84367, October 8, 2020
Acknowledgment of Received Transfer Application, Letter—Transfer No. 84441, October 21, 2020
Publication Requests for Legal Notice of Transfer No. 84441, Emails, October 21, 2020
Request for Watermaster Written Comment and/or Recommendations on Transfer No. 84441, Letter, October 21, 2020
Notice of Protest—Whittaker Two Dot Ranch, LLC, November 6, 2020
Proof of Publication—Post Register, November 6, 2020
Affidavit of Publication—The Recorder Herald, November 9, 2020 80

TABLE OF CONTENTS-1

Notice of Protest—David Tomchak, November 9, 2020	81–93
Affidavit of Publication—Idaho Statesman, November 12, 2020	94
Affidavit of Publication—Tribune Publishing Company, November 12, 2020	95
Notice of Protest—Smith 2p Ranch, November 12, 2020	96–98
Proof of Publication—Times-News, November 12, 2020	99
Notice of Protest—James Whittaker, November 13, 2020	100–101
Notice of Protest—Steven Johnson, November 13, 2020	102–103
Notice of Protest—Rosalie Ericsson, November 16, 2020	104–105
Acknowledgment of Received Transfer Application Protests, Letter—Transfer No. 84441, November 19, 2020	
Watermaster Response to Request for Written Comment and/or Recommendations on Transfer No. 84441, Email, November 24, 2020	110
Notice of Pre-hearing Conference, December 22, 2020	111–115
Notice of Hearing and Scheduling Order, February 19, 2021	116–118
Notice of Status Conferences, February 19, 2021	119–120
Notice of Service of McConnell First Set of Discovery, February 25, 2021	121–122
Notice of Appearance—James Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC, March 5, 2021	123–125
Notice of Service of Discovery Requests—James Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC, March 9, 2021	126–128
McConnell Witness and Exhibit List, April 7, 2021	129–131
Notice of Appearance—David Tomchak, April 7, 2021	132–133
Notice of Service of McConnell Witness and Exhibit List, April 7, 2021	134–135
Tomchak Witness/Exhibit List, April 7, 2021	136–138
Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC Joint Witness and Exhibit List, April 7, 2021	139–143
McConnell Memorandum in Support of Motion in Limine and/or Motion to Strike, April 9, 2021	144–150

McConnell Motion in Limine and/or Motion to Strike, April 9, 2021 151–152
Tomchak's Notice Joining in Part McConnells' Motion in Limine, April 12, 2021
Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC's Memorandum in Opposition to McConnell Motion in Limine and/or Motion to Strike, April 20, 2021 156–175
Roster of Attendance for Hearing on Application for Transfer No. 84441, April 21, 2021
Exhibit List for Hearing on Application for Transfer No. 84441, April 22, 2021
Roster of Attendance for Hearing on Application for Transfer No. 84441, April 22, 2021
Witness List for Hearing on Application for Transfer No. 84441, April 22, 2021
Preliminary Order Approving Transfer—Transfer No. 84441, May 18, 2021 182–215
Petition for Reconsideration of a Preliminary Order on Application No. 84441—Steven Johnson, June 1, 2021
Petition to Re-open Hearing and Petition for Site Visit and Memorandum in Support—James Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC, June 1, 2021
Whittaker's Petition for Reconsideration—James Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC, June 1, 2021
Opposition to Whittaker Petition to Re-open Hearing and Petition for Site Visit and Memorandum in Support; Opposition to Declaration of Bryce Contor—Bruce and Glenda McConnell, June 10, 2021
Order Denying Petition to Re-open Hearing and Petition for Site Visit, June 21, 2021
Order Denying Petition to Re-open Hearing and Petition for Site Visit, June
Order Denying Petition to Re-open Hearing and Petition for Site Visit, June 21, 2021

EXHIBITS OFFERED AND ADMITTED DURING THE AGENCY HEARING April 21–22, 2021

Exhibit 1—Scott King's Expert Report
Exhibit 2—Scott King's Résumé
Exhibit 3—July 28, 2020 Emails Regarding Lee Creek Water Administration
Exhibit 4—August 6, 2020 Letter from Cindy Yenter to McConnell 506
Exhibit 5—August 6, 2020 Letter from Cindy Yenter to Merritt Udy Regarding Watermaster Instructions
Exhibit 6—Ocotber 8, 2020 Idaho Department of Water Resources Approval of Transfer No. 84367
Exhibit 7—Ocotber 5, 2020 James Cefalo Memo Regarding Transfer No. 84367
Exhibit 8—October 6, 2020 McConnell Transfer Application Regarding Transfer No. 84441
Exhibit 9—McConnell SRBA Partial Decrees
Exhibit 10—November 24, 2020 Cindy Yenter Watermaster Recommendation Regarding McConnell Transfer No. 84441
Exhibit 11—May 4, 1983 Lemhi Decree Regarding Water Right No. 74-157 555
Exhibit 12—May 2, 1990 SRBA Claim Regarding Water Right No. 74-157 556–558
Exhibit 13—May 27, 2004 Notice of Error Regarding Water Right No. 74-157
Exhibit 14—April 3, 2012 SRBA Partial Decree Regarding Water Right No. 74-157

TABLE OF CONTENTS-4

Exhibit 15—November 6, 2020 Whittaker Transfer No. 84508 to Remove Lee Creek as Tributary to Water Right No. 74-157
Exhibit 16—November 20, 2020 McConnell Protest as to Whittaker Transfer No. 84508
Exhibit 17—November 24, 2020 Cindy Yenter Watermaster Recommendation Regarding Whittaker Transfer No. 84508
Exhibit 18—February 8, 2021 Whittaker Withdrawal of Transfer No. 84508 581
Exhibit 19—February 18, 2021 Idaho Department of Water Resources Acknowledgment of Withdrawal of Transfer No. 84508
Exhibit 20—June 23, 2020 Letter from Cindy Yenter to Whittaker 583
Exhibit 22—1993 Warranty Deed (Horton to McConnell) 584–585
Exhibit 23—Policy of Title Insurance for Bruce and Glenda McConnell 586–589
Exhibit 24—USGS Stroud Creek Quadrangle Map 590
Exhibit 151—Injury Analysis of Application for Transfer No. 84441 by Bryce Contor
Exhibit 152—Observation of East Springs Water Source of Water Right No. 74-157 by Bryce Contor
Exhibit 153—Observation of Lee Creek, Kauer Ditch, and West Springs Water Source of Idaho Water Right No. 74-157 by Bryce Contor
Exhibit 154—Engineer Map from 1954741
Exhibit 155—Legend of Engineer Map from 1954 742
Exhibit 156—Whittaker v. Kauer, 78 Idaho 94, 298 P .2d 745 (1956) 743-746
Exhibit 157— <i>Whittaker v. Kauer</i> , No. 3665, (Lemhi Cnty. Dist. Ct. Idaho May 9, 1955)
Exhibit 158—August 6, 2020 Letter from Cindy Yenter to Merritt Udy Regarding Watermaster Instructions
Exhibit 159—Photo of Whittaker's Stroud Creek Headgate from Rosalie Ericsson's Property
Exhibit 160—Photo of Whittaker's Weir with Measuring Device on Stroud Ditch751
Exhibit 161—Photo of Whittaker's Open 2' Cipoletti Weir

Exhibit 301—Photo of Whittaker's Weir by Rosalie Ericsson's Property 753
Exhibit 302—Photo of Whittaker's Stroud Creek Headgate
Exhibit 303—Photo of Overflowing Ditch Below Whittaker's Headgate
Exhibit 304—Photo of McConnell's Filed-upon Headgate
Exhibit 305—Photo of Land by McConnell's Upper Ditch
Exhibit 306—Photo of McConnell's Upper Ditch Weir758
Exhibit 307—Photo of McConnell's Lower Ditch Weir
Exhibit 308—Photo of McConnell's Upper Ditch Streambed 760
Exhibit 309—Photo of McConnell's Lower Ditch Headgate
Exhibit 310—Photo of Water Diverted to McConnell's Lower Ditch
Exhibit 311—Photo of Left Side of McConnell's Lower Ditch Headgate
Exhibit 312—Photo of Water Flow of McConnell's Upper Ditch

AGENCY RECORD CERTIFICATIONS AND NOTICES

Notice of Lodging the Agency Transcript and Record with the Agency, February 3, 2022
McConnell Objection to Agency Record, February 16, 2022 768-771
Agency's Certificate of Record and Exhibits, February 17, 2022 772–773
Response to Objection; Order Settling the Agency Transcript and Record, February 17, 2022
Notice of Lodging the Settled Agency Transcript and Record with the District Court, February 17, 2022

INDEX

SETTLED AGENCY RECORD Prepared by the Idaho Department of Water Resources

Administrative Proceeding In re Application for Transfer No. 84441 in the Name of Bruce and Glenda McConnell

Acknowledgment of Received Transfer Application, Letter—Transfer No. 84441, October 21, 2020	67
Acknowledgment of Received Transfer Application Protests, Letter—Transfer No. 84441, November 19, 2020	
Affidavit of Publication—Idaho Statesman, November 12, 2020	94
Affidavit of Publication—The Recorder Herald, November 9, 2020	80
Affidavit of Publication—Tribune Publishing Company, November 12, 2020	95
Agency's Certificate of Record and Exhibits, February 17, 2022	772–773
Application for Transfer of Water Right Nos. 74-361, 74-362, 74-363, 74-364, 74-365, 74-367, and 74-368 with Cover Letter—Transfer No. 84367—Bruce and Glenda McConnell, September 9, 2020	15–30
Application for Transfer of Water Right Nos. 74-361, 74-362, 74-363, 74-364, 74-365, 74-367, and 74-368 with Cover Letter—Transfer No. 84441—Bruce and Glenda McConnell, October 5, 2020	41–44
Approved Transfer of Water Right Nos. 74-361, 74-362, 74-363, 74-364, 74-365, 74-367, and 74-368—Transfer No. 84367 Preliminary Order, October 8, 2020	45–64
Declaration of Bruce McConnell—Transfer No. 84367—Bruce and Glenda McConnell, September 9, 2020	31–33
Exceptions to Preliminary Order Approving Transfer, Order Denying Petition to Re-open Hearing, and Petition for Site Visit—James Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC, July 6, 2021	277–324
Exhibit 1—Scott King's Expert Report	353–498
Exhibit 2—Scott King's Résumé	499–502
Exhibit 3—July 28, 2020 Emails Regarding Lee Creek Water Administration	503–505

INDEX-1

Exhibit 4—August 6, 2020 Letter from Cindy Yenter to McConnell 506	
Exhibit 5—August 6, 2020 Letter from Cindy Yenter to Merritt Udy Regarding Watermaster Instructions	08
Exhibit 6—Ocotber 8, 2020 Idaho Department of Water Resources Approval of Transfer No. 84367	30
Exhibit 7—Ocotber 5, 2020 James Cefalo Memo Regarding Transfer No. 84367	
Exhibit 8—October 6, 2020 McConnell Transfer Application Regarding Transfer No. 84441	44
Exhibit 9—McConnell SRBA Partial Decrees	53
Exhibit 10—November 24, 2020 Cindy Yenter Watermaster Recommendation Regarding McConnell Transfer No. 84441	
Exhibit 11—May 4, 1983 Lemhi Decree Regarding Water Right No. 74-157 555	
Exhibit 12—May 2, 1990 SRBA Claim Regarding Water Right No. 74-157 556–55	58
Exhibit 13—May 27, 2004 Notice of Error Regarding Water Right No. 74-157	
Exhibit 14—April 3, 2012 SRBA Partial Decree Regarding Water Right No. 74-157	
Exhibit 15—November 6, 2020 Whittaker Transfer No. 84508 to Remove Lee Creek as Tributary to Water Right No. 74-157	
	74
Exhibit 16—November 20, 2020 McConnell Protest as to Whittaker Transfer No. 84508	
Exhibit 16—November 20, 2020 McConnell Protest as to Whittaker Transfer	78
Exhibit 16—November 20, 2020 McConnell Protest as to Whittaker Transfer No. 84508	78
Exhibit 16—November 20, 2020 McConnell Protest as to Whittaker Transfer No. 84508	78
Exhibit 16—November 20, 2020 McConnell Protest as to Whittaker Transfer No. 84508	78
Exhibit 16—November 20, 2020 McConnell Protest as to Whittaker Transfer No. 84508	78
Exhibit 16—November 20, 2020 McConnell Protest as to Whittaker Transfer No. 84508	78 80 85
Exhibit 16—November 20, 2020 McConnell Protest as to Whittaker Transfer No. 84508	78 80 85

INDEX-2

INDEX-3

Exhibit 312—Photo of Water Flow of McConnell's Upper Ditch	764
Exhibit List for Hearing on Application for Transfer No. 84441, April 22, 2021	177–179
Index	9–14
McConnell Memorandum in Support of Motion in Limine and/or Motion to Strike, April 9, 2021	144–150
McConnell Motion in Limine and/or Motion to Strike, April 9, 2021	151–152
McConnell Objection to Agency Record, February 16, 2022	768–771
McConnell Witness and Exhibit List, April 7, 2021	129–131
Notice of Appeal and Petition for Judicial Review of Final Agency Action— James Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC, November 30, 2021	345–352
Notice of Appearance—David Tomchak, April 7, 2021	132–133
Notice of Appearance—James Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC, March 5, 2021	123–125
Notice of Hearing and Scheduling Order, February 19, 2021	116–118
Notice of Lodging the Agency Transcript and Record with the Agency, February 3, 2022	765–767
Notice of Lodging the Settled Agency Transcript and Record with the District Court, February 17, 2022	778–781
Notice of Pre-hearing Conference, December 22, 2020	111–115
Notice of Protest—David Tomchak, November 9, 2020	81–93
Notice of Protest—James Whittaker, November 13, 2020	100–101
Notice of Protest—Rosalie Ericsson, November 16, 2020	104–105
Notice of Protest—Smith 2p Ranch, November 12, 2020	96–98
Notice of Protest—Steven Johnson, November 13, 2020	102–103
Notice of Protest—Whittaker Two Dot Ranch, LLC, November 6, 2020	76–78
Notice of Service of Discovery Requests—James Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC, March 9, 2021	126–128
Notice of Service of McConnell First Set of Discovery, February 25, 2021	121–122

Notice of Service of McConnell Witness and Exhibit List, April 7, 2021 134–135
Notice of Status Conferences, February 19, 2021 119–120
Opposition to Whittaker Petition to Re-open Hearing and Petition for Site Visit and Memorandum in Support; Opposition to Declaration of Bryce Contor—Bruce and Glenda McConnell, June 10, 2021
Order Denying Petition to Re-open Hearing and Petition for Site Visit, June 21, 2021
Order Denying Petitions for Reconsideration, June 21, 2021
Order Extending Deadline to Issue Final Order, September 7, 2021 332–334
Order on Exceptions; Final Order Approving Transfer, November 2, 2021 339–344
Petition for Reconsideration of a Preliminary Order on Application No. 84441—Steven Johnson, June 1, 2021
Petition for the Director to Review Preliminary Order Approving Transfer, Order Denying Petition to Re-open Hearing, and Petition for Site Visit— James Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC, July 6, 2021 325–328
Petition to Re-open Hearing and Petition for Site Visit and Memorandum in Support—James Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC, June 1, 2021
Preliminary Order Approving Transfer—Transfer No. 84441, May 18, 2021 182–215
Proof of Publication—Post Register, November 6, 2020
Proof of Publication—Times-News, November 12, 2020
Proof Reports for Water Right Nos. 74-361, 74-362, 74-363, 74-364, 74-365, 74-367, and 74-368—Transfer No. 84367, September 10, 2020
Publication Requests for Legal Notice of Transfer No. 84441, Emails, October 21, 2020
Request for Watermaster Written Comment and/or Recommendations on Transfer No. 84441, Letter, October 21, 2020
Response to Letter from Glenda McConnell (Letter Attached), Email, July 8, 2021
Response to Objection; Order Settling the Agency Transcript and Record, February 17, 2022

Roster of Attendance for Hearing on Application for Transfer No. 84441, April 21, 2021 1	.76
Roster of Attendance for Hearing on Application for Transfer No. 84441, April 22, 2021 1	.80
Second Order Extending Deadline to Issue Final Order, October 14, 2021 3	35–338
Table of Contents 3	5-8
Tomchak Witness/Exhibit List, April 7, 2021 1	36–138
Tomchak's Notice Joining in Part McConnells' Motion in Limine, April 12, 2021	53–155
Transfer Approval Notice for Water Right Nos. 74-361, 74-362, 74-363, 74-364, 74-365, 74-367, and 74-368, Letter—Transfer No. 84367, October 8, 2020	5–66
Watermaster Response to Request for Written Comment and/or Recommendations on Transfer No. 84441, Email, November 24, 2020 1	10
Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC Joint Witness and Exhibit List, April 7, 2021	39–143
Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC's Memorandum in Opposition to McConnell Motion in Limine and/or Motion to Strike, April 20, 2021 1	56–175
Whittaker's Petition for Reconsideration—James Whittaker and Whittaker Two Dot Ranch LLC, June 1, 2021	224
Witness List for Hearing on Application for Transfer No. 84441, April 22, 2021	81